Reply to Office action of December 9, 2008

**AMENDMENTS TO THE DRAWINGS:** 

The attached replacement sheets of drawings, including Figures 2A and 2B replace the

previously submitted sheets of drawings including Figures 2A and 2B. More specifically,

Applicant has amended Figures 2A and 2B. Each replacement sheet has been clearly labeled

"Replacement Sheet" in the page header.

Attachment: 2 Replacement Sheets of drawings including Figures 2A and 2B

Reply to Office action of December 9, 2008

**REMARKS** 

Claims 1, 2, 4-8, and 10-13 are pending in the above-captioned application. Claims 3 and

9 have been cancelled. Claims 1, 8, and 13 have been amended. Claims 1, 8, 10, and 13 are in

independent form.

**Specification** 

The specification has been amended to include reference numbers added in the drawings.

Applicants attest that no new matter has been added thereto.

**Drawings** 

Applicants have attached 2 replacement sheets of drawings, including Figures 2A and 2B,

hereto directly following these Remarks. Each replacement sheet has been labeled as

"Replacement Sheet" in the page header as per 37 C.F.R. §1.121(d).

In amended Figure 2A, reference character "17" has been added to identify the open

upper portion 17 of the inner sheet metal layer 16 in order to correspond with changes made in

the specification.

In amended Figure 2B, reference character "17" has been added to identify the open

upper portion 17 of the inner sheet metal layer 16 in order to correspond with changes made in

the specification.

Applicants attest that no new matter has been added thereto.

Claim Rejections – 35 U.S.C. §102

1-2. Claims 1, 2, 4, 7-9, and 13 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. §102(b) as being

unpatentable over United States Patent 5,536,060 to Rashid et al. ("the '060 reference").

Applicants respectfully traverse the rejection.

Independent claim 1 of the above-captioned application has been amended to include the

limitation, "wherein said inner sheet metal layer includes a pair of spaced apart end walls

Reply to Office action of December 9, 2008

connected only by a bottom wall extending between said pair of spaced apart end walls thereby defining a substantially U-shaped structure having an open upper portion and said structural reinforcement member includes a top member that abuts said outer sheet metal layer and extends thereacross adjacent said open upper portion of said U-shaped structure of said inner sheet metal layer."

The Examiner contends that an inner panel 16 in the '060 reference is substantially U-shaped including an extra element 38 cooperating with the U-shaped portion. The '060 reference does not disclose an inner sheet metal layer that includes a pair of spaced apart end walls connected only by a bottom wall extending between the pair of spaced apart end walls thereby defining a substantially U-shaped structure having an open upper portion, as specifically required by amended claim 1 of the above-captioned application. In the '060 reference, the inner panel 16 includes a front side portion 32 and a rear side portion 34 that are connected by a bottom portion 36 and a window sill support member 38. Thus, it is clear that the front and rear side portions 32, 34 are not connected only by the bottom portion 36. Further, it is clear that the inner panel 16 does not include an open upper portion because the window sill support member 38 extends between the upper ends of the front and rear side portions 32, 34 such that the upper portion is closed, not open. Thus, each and every limitation in amended claim 1 is not found either expressly or inherently in the '060 reference.

Claims 2, 4, and 7 depend from claim 1 and, as such, must be construed to incorporate by reference all the limitations of the claim to which they refer, see 35 U.S.C. §112, fourth paragraph. Thus, claims 2, 4, and 7 must be read as including the limitation of an inner sheet metal layer having a pair of spaced apart end walls connected only by a bottom wall extending between the pair of spaced apart end walls thereby defining a substantially U-shaped structure having an open upper portion. For the reasons set forth above, claims 2, 4, and 7 are not anticipated by the '060 reference.

Independent claim 8 of the above-captioned application has been amended to include the limitation, "an inner sheet metal layer including a pair of spaced apart end walls connected only by a bottom wall extending between the pair of spaced apart end walls thereby defining a substantially U-shaped structure having an open upper portion."

Reply to Office action of December 9, 2008

The Examiner contends that an inner panel 16 in the '060 reference is substantially U-shaped including an extra element 38 cooperating with the U-shaped portion. The '060 reference does not disclose an inner sheet metal layer that includes a pair of spaced apart end walls connected only by a bottom wall extending between the pair of spaced apart end walls thereby defining a substantially U-shaped structure having an open upper portion, as specifically required by amended claim 8 of the above-captioned application. In the '060 reference, the inner panel 16 includes a front side portion 32 and a rear side portion 34 that are connected by a bottom portion 36 and a window sill support member 38. Thus, it is clear that the front and rear side portions 32, 34 are not connected only by the bottom portion 36. Further, it is clear that the inner panel 16 does not include an open upper portion because the window sill support member 38 extends between the upper ends of the front and rear side portions 32, 34 such that the upper portion is closed, not open. Thus, each and every limitation in amended claim 8 is not found either expressly or inherently in the '060 reference.

Applicants have cancelled claim 9.

Independent claim 13 of the above-captioned application has been amended to include the limitation, "an inner sheet metal layer, the inner sheet metal layer including a pair of spaced apart end walls connected only by a bottom wall extending between the pair of spaced apart end walls, said inner sheet metal layer also including a latch mounting surface and at least one hinge mounting surface."

The Examiner contends that an inner panel 16 in the '060 reference is substantially U-shaped including an extra element 38 cooperating with the U-shaped portion. The '060 reference does not disclose an inner sheet metal layer that includes a pair of spaced apart end walls connected only by a bottom wall extending between the pair of spaced apart end walls, as specifically required by amended claim 13 of the above-captioned application. In the '060 reference, the inner panel 16 includes a front side portion 32 and a rear side portion 34 that are connected by a bottom portion 36 and a window sill support member 38. Thus, it is clear that the front and rear side portions 32, 34 are not connected only by the bottom portion 36. Thus, each and every limitation in amended claim 13 is not found either expressly or inherently in the '060 reference.

Reply to Office action of December 9, 2008

Therefore, Applicants respectfully request that the rejection of claims 1, 2, 4, 7-9, and 13 under 35 U.S.C. §102(b) as being unpatentable over the '060 reference be withdrawn.

Claim Rejections – 35 U.S.C. §103

3-5. Claims 5 and 6 have been rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable

over the '060 reference. Applicants respectfully traverse the rejection.

Claims 5 and 6 depend from claim 1 and, as such, must be construed to incorporate by

reference all the limitations of the claim to which they refer, see 35 U.S.C. §112, fourth

paragraph. Thus, claims 5 and 6 must be read as including the limitation of an inner sheet metal

layer having a pair of spaced apart end walls connected only by a bottom wall extending between

the pair of spaced apart end walls thereby defining a substantially U-shaped structure having an

open upper portion. Since each and every limitation in amended claim 1 is not found either

expressly or inherently in the '060, claims 5 and 6 are not unpatentable over the '060 reference.

Therefore, Applicants respectfully request that the rejection of claims 5 and 6 under 35

U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over the '060 reference be withdrawn.

Allowable Subject Matter

6. Claims 10-12 have been allowed.

It is respectfully submitted that this patent application is in condition for allowance,

which allowance is respectfully solicited. If the Examiner has any questions regarding this

amendment or the patent application, the Examiner is invited to contact the undersigned.

Respectfully submitted,

id J. Ford (Reg. No. 62,462)

Clark Hill PLC

500 Woodward Avenue, Suite 3500

Detroit, MI 48226-3435

(313) 965-8575

Attorney Docket No: 19339-104598

MN: 702710US

5707938.1 19339/104598